

Article 7D.

Environmental Audit Privilege and Limited Immunity.

§ 8-58.50. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note). Purpose.

(a) In order to encourage owners and operators of facilities and persons conducting activities regulated under those portions of the General Statutes set forth in G.S. 8-58.52, or conducting activities regulated under other environmental laws, to conduct voluntary internal environmental audits of their compliance programs and management systems and to assess and improve compliance with statutes, an environmental audit privilege is recognized to protect the confidentiality of communications relating to voluntary internal environmental audits.

(b) Nothing in this Article shall be construed to protect owners and operators of facilities and regulated persons from a criminal investigation or prosecution carried out by any appropriate governmental entity.

(c) Any privilege granted by this Article shall apply only to those communications, oral or written, pertaining to and made in connection with the environmental audit and shall not apply to the facts relating to the violation itself. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.51. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Definitions.

The following definitions apply in this Article:

- (1) "Department" means the Department of Environmental Quality.
- (2) "Enforcement agencies" means the Department, any other agency of the State, and units of local government responsible for enforcement of environmental laws.
- (3) "Environmental audit" means a voluntary, internal evaluation or review of one or more facilities or an activity at one or more facilities regulated under federal, State, regional, or local environmental law, or of compliance programs or management systems related to the facility or activity if designed to identify and prevent noncompliance and to improve compliance with these laws. For the purposes of this Article, an environmental audit does not include an environmental site assessment of a facility conducted solely in anticipation of the purchase, sale, or transfer of the business or facility. An environmental audit may be conducted by the owner or operator, the parent corporation of the owner or operator or by their officers or employees, or by independent contractors. An environmental audit must be a discrete activity with a specified beginning date and scheduled ending date reflecting the auditor's bona fide intended completion schedule.
- (4) "Environmental audit report" means a document marked or identified as such with a completion date existing either individually or as a compilation prepared in connection with an environmental audit. An environmental audit report may include field notes and records of observations, findings, opinions, suggestions, recommendations, conclusions, drafts, memoranda, drawings, photographs, computer-generated or electronically recorded information, maps, charts, graphs, and surveys, provided the supporting information is collected or developed for the primary purpose and in the course of an environmental audit. An environmental audit report, when completed, may include all of the following components:

- a. An audit report prepared by an auditor, which may include the scope and date of the audit and the information gained in the audit, together with exhibits and appendices and may include conclusions, recommendations, exhibits, and appendices.
 - b. Memoranda and documents analyzing any portion of the audit report or issues relating to the implementation of an audit report.
 - c. An implementation plan that addresses correcting past noncompliance, improving current compliance, or preventing future noncompliance.
- (5) "Environmental laws" means all provisions of federal, State, and local laws, rules, and ordinances pertaining to environmental matters. (2015-241, s. 14.30(u); 2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.52. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Applicability.

(a) This Article applies to activities regulated under environmental laws, including all of the following provisions of the General Statutes, and rules adopted thereunder:

- (1) Article 7 of Chapter 74.
- (2) Chapter 104E.
- (3) Article 25 of Chapter 113.
- (4) Articles 1, 4, and 7 of Chapter 113A.
- (5) Article 9 of Chapter 130A, except as provided in subsection (b) of this section.
- (6) Articles 21, 21A, and 21B of Chapter 143.
- (7) Part 1 of Article 7 of Chapter 143B.

(b) This Article shall not apply to activities regulated under the Coal Ash Management Act of 2014 under Part 2I of Article 9 of Chapter 130A of the General Statutes and rules promulgated pursuant to that Part. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.53. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Environmental audit report; privilege.

(a) An environmental audit report or any part of an environmental audit report is privileged and, therefore, immune from discovery and is not admissible as evidence in civil or administrative proceedings, except as provided in G.S. 8-58.54 and G.S. 8-58.56. Provided, however, all of the following documents are exempt from the privilege established by this Article:

- (1) Information obtained by observation of an enforcement agency.
- (2) Information obtained from a source independent of the environmental audit.
- (3) Documents, communication, data, reports, or other information required to be collected, maintained, otherwise made available, or reported to an enforcement agency or any other entity by environmental laws, permits, orders, consent agreements, or as otherwise provided by law.
- (4) Documents prepared either prior to the beginning of the environmental audit or subsequent to the completion date of the audit report and, in all cases, any documents prepared independent of the audit or audit report.
- (5) Documents prepared as a result of multiple or continuous self-auditing conducted in an effort to intentionally avoid liability for violations.
- (6) Information that is knowingly misrepresented or misstated or that is knowingly deleted or withheld from an environmental audit report, whether or not included in a subsequent environmental audit report.

(7) Information in instances where the material shows evidence of noncompliance with environmental laws, permits, orders, consent agreements, and the owner or operator failed to either promptly take corrective action or eliminate any violation of law identified during the environmental audit within a reasonable period of time.

(b) If an environmental audit report or any part of an environmental audit report is subject to the privilege provided for in subsection (a) of this section, no person who conducted or participated in the audit or who significantly reviewed the audit report may be compelled to testify regarding the audit report or a privileged part of the audit report except as provided for in G.S. 8-58.53(d), 8-58.54, or 8-58.56.

(c) Nothing in this Article shall be construed to restrict a party in a proceeding before the Industrial Commission from obtaining or discovering any evidence necessary or appropriate for the proof of any issue pending in an action before the Commission, regardless of whether evidence is privileged pursuant to this Article. Further, nothing in this Article shall be construed to prevent the admissibility of evidence that is otherwise relevant and admissible in a proceeding before the Industrial Commission, regardless of whether the evidence is privileged pursuant to this Article. Provided, however, the Commission, upon motion made by a party to the proceeding, may issue appropriate protective orders preventing disclosure of information outside of the Commission's proceeding.

(d) Nothing in this Article shall be construed to circumvent the employee protection provisions provided by federal or State law.

(e) The privilege created by this Article does not apply to criminal investigations or proceedings. Where an audit report is obtained, reviewed, or used in a criminal proceeding, the privilege created by this Article shall continue to apply and is not waived in civil and administrative proceedings and is not discoverable or admissible in civil or administrative proceedings even if disclosed during a criminal proceeding. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.54. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Waiver of privilege.

(a) The privilege established under G.S. 8-58.53 does not apply to the extent that it is expressly waived in writing by the owner or operator of a facility at which an environmental audit was conducted and who prepared or caused to be prepared the audit report as a result of the audit.

(b) The audit report and information generated by the audit may be disclosed without waiving the privilege established under G.S. 8-58.53 to all of the following persons:

- (1) A person employed by the owner or operator or the parent corporation of the audited facility.
- (2) A legal representative of the owner or operator or parent corporation.
- (3) An independent contractor retained by the owner or operator or parent corporation to conduct an audit on or to address an issue or issues raised by the audit.

(c) Disclosure of an audit report or information generated by the audit under all of the following circumstances shall not constitute a waiver of the privilege established under G.S. 8-58.53:

- (1) Disclosure made under the terms of a confidentiality agreement between the owner or operator of the facility audited and a potential purchaser of the business or facility audited.

- (2) Disclosure made under the terms of a confidentiality agreement between governmental officials and the owner or operator of the facility audited.
- (3) Disclosure made under the terms of a confidentiality agreement between a customer, lending institution, or insurance company with an existing or proposed relationship with the facility. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.55. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Notification of audit.

In order to assert the privilege established under G.S. 8-58.53, the owner or operator of the facility conducting the environmental audit shall, upon inspection of the facility by an enforcement agency, or no later than 10 working days after completion of an agency's inspection, notify the enforcement agency of the existence of any audit relevant to the subject of the agency's inspection, as well as the beginning date and completion date of that audit. Any environmental audit report shall include a signed certification from the owner or operator of the facility that documents the date the audit began and the completion date of the audit. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.56. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Revocation of privilege in civil and administrative proceedings.

In a civil or administrative proceeding, an enforcement agency may seek by motion a declaratory ruling on the issue of whether an environmental audit report is privileged. The court shall revoke the privilege established under G.S. 8-58.53 for an audit report if the factors set forth in this section apply. In a civil proceeding, the court, after an in camera review, shall revoke the privilege established under G.S. 8-58.53 if the court determines that disclosure of the environmental audit report was sought after the effective date of this Article and either of the following apply:

- (1) The privilege is asserted for purposes of deception or evasion.
- (2) The material shows evidence of significant noncompliance with applicable environmental laws; the owner or operator of the facility has not promptly initiated and pursued with diligence appropriate action to achieve compliance with these environmental laws or has not made reasonable efforts to complete any necessary permit application; and, as a result, the owner or operator of the facility did not or will not achieve compliance with applicable environmental laws or did not or will not complete the necessary permit application within a reasonable period of time. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.57. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Privilege in criminal proceedings.

The privilege established under G.S. 8-58.53 is not applicable in any criminal proceeding. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.58. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Burden of proof.

A party asserting the privilege established under G.S. 8-58.53 has the burden of proving that (i) the materials claimed as privileged constitute an environmental audit report as defined by this Article, and (ii) compliance has been achieved or will be achieved within a reasonable period of time. A party seeking disclosure under G.S. 8-58.56 has the burden of proving the condition for disclosure set forth in that section. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.59. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Stipulations; declaratory rulings.

The parties to a proceeding may at any time stipulate to entry of an order directing that specific information contained in an environmental audit report is or is not subject to the privilege. In the absence of an ongoing proceeding, where the parties are not in agreement, an enforcement agency may seek a declaratory ruling from a court on the issue of whether the materials are privileged under G.S. 8-58.53 and whether the privilege, if existing, should be revoked pursuant to G.S. 8-58.56. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.60. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Construction of Article.

Nothing in this Article limits, waives, or abrogates any of the following:

- (1) The scope or nature of any statutory or common law privilege, including the work-product privilege or the attorney-client privilege.
- (2) Any existing ability or authority under State law to challenge privilege.
- (3) An enforcement agency's ability to obtain or use documents or information that the agency otherwise has the authority to obtain under State law adopted pursuant to federally delegated programs. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.61. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Voluntary disclosure; limited immunity from civil and administrative penalties and fines.

(a) An owner or operator of a facility is immune from imposition of civil and administrative penalties and fines for a violation of environmental laws voluntarily disclosed subject to the requirements and criteria set forth in this section. Provided, however, that waiver of penalties and fines shall not be granted until the applicable enforcement agency has certified that the violation was corrected within a reasonable period of time. If compliance is not certified by the enforcement agency, the enforcement agency shall retain discretion to assess penalties and fines for the violation.

(b) If a person or entity makes a voluntary disclosure of a violation of environmental laws discovered through performance of an environmental audit, that person has the burden of proving (i) that the disclosure is voluntary by establishing the elements set forth in subsection (c) of this section and (ii) that the person is therefore entitled to immunity from any administrative or civil penalties associated with the issues disclosed. Nothing in this section may be construed to provide immunity from criminal penalties.

(c) For purposes of this section, disclosure is voluntary if all of the following criteria are met:

- (1) The disclosure is made within 14 days following a reasonable investigation of the violation's discovery through the environmental audit.
- (2) The disclosure is made to an enforcement agency having regulatory authority over the violation disclosed.
- (3) The person or entity making the disclosure initiates an action to resolve the violation identified in the disclosure in a diligent manner.
- (4) The person or entity making the disclosure cooperates with the applicable enforcement agency in connection with investigation of the issues identified in the disclosure.
- (5) The person or entity making the disclosure diligently pursues compliance and promptly corrects the noncompliance within a reasonable period of time.

(d) A disclosure is not voluntary for purposes of this section if any of the following factors apply:

- (1) Specific permit conditions require monitoring or sampling records and reports or assessment plans and management plans to be maintained or submitted to the enforcement agency pursuant to an established schedule.
- (2) Environmental laws or specific permit conditions require notification of releases to the environment.
- (3) The violation was committed intentionally, willfully, or through criminal negligence by the person or entity making the disclosure.
- (4) The violation was not corrected in a diligent manner.
- (5) The violation posed or poses a significant threat to public health, safety, and welfare; the environment; and natural resources.
- (6) The violation occurred within one year of a similar prior violation at the same facility, and immunity from civil and administrative penalties was granted by the applicable enforcement agency for the prior violation.
- (7) The violation has resulted in a substantial economic benefit to the owner or operator of the facility.
- (8) The violation is a violation of the specific terms of a judicial or administrative order.

(e) If a person meets the burden of proving that the disclosure is voluntary, the burden shifts to the enforcement agency to prove that the disclosure was not voluntary, based upon the factors set forth in this section. The person claiming immunity from civil or administrative penalties or fines under this section retains the ultimate burden of proving the violations were voluntarily disclosed.

(f) A voluntary disclosure made pursuant to this section is subject to disclosure pursuant to the Public Records Act in accordance with the provisions of Chapter 132 of the General Statutes. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.62. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Additional limitations on exercise of privilege or immunity.

An owner or operator of a facility who makes a voluntary disclosure of a violation of environmental laws discovered through performance of an environmental audit shall only be entitled to exercise of the privilege or immunity established by this Article once in a two-year period, not more than twice in a five-year period, and not more than three times in a 10-year period. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)

§ 8-58.63. (Article has a contingent effective date – see note) Preemption of local laws.

No local law, rule, ordinance, or permit condition may circumvent or limit the privilege established by this Article or the exercise of the privileges or the presumption and immunity established by this Article. (2015-286, s. 4.1(a).)